

Supernova Cosmology with high redshift clusters

Principal Investigator: Prof. Saul Perlmutter

Institution: University of California - Berkeley

Electronic Mail: saul@lbl.gov

Scientific Category: COSMOLOGY

Scientific Keywords: COSMOLOGICAL PARAMETERS AND DISTANCE SCALE, CLUSTERS OF GALAXIES, SUPERNOVAE

Instruments: ACS

Proprietary Period: 12

	3 Gyro Mode Orbit Request		2 Gyro Mode Orbit Request	
	Prime	Parallel	Prime	Parallel
Cycle 14	140	0	140	0
Cycle 15	40	0	40	0
Total	180	0	180	0

Abstract

Abstract here

Investigators:

	Investigator	Institution	Country
PI	Prof. Saul Perlmutter	University of California - Berkeley	USA/CA
CoI	Dr. Greg Aldering	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Prof. L Felipe Barrientos	Universidad Catolica de Chile	Chile
CoI	Dr. Mark Brodwin	University of Toronto	Canada
CoI	Dr. Kyle Dawson	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Dr. Peter Eisenhardt	Jet Propulsion Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Dr. Erica Ellingson	University of Colorado at Boulder	USA/CO
CoI	Dr. Vitaliy Fadeyev	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Dr. Andrew Fruchter	Space Telescope Science Institute	USA/MD
CoI	Dr. David Gilbank	University of Toronto	Canada
CoI	Dr. Michael Gladders	Carnegie Institution of Washington	USA/DC
CoI	Prof. Gerson Goldhaber	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Dr. Anthony H. Gonzalez	University of Florida	USA/FL
CoI*	Prof. Ariel Goobar	Stockholm University	Sweden
CoI*	Dr. Henk Hoekstra	University of Toronto	Canada
CoI	Dr. Marek Kowalski	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Prof. Lori M. Lubin	University of California - Davis	USA/CA
CoI*	Dr. Nino Panagia	Space Telescope Science Institute - ESA	USA/MD
CoI*	Dr. Piero Rosati	European Southern Observatory - Germany	Germany
CoI	Dr. David J. Schlegel	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Dr. Anthony L. Spadafora	Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory	USA/CA
CoI	Dr. S. Adam Stanford	University of California - Davis	USA/CA
CoI*	Dr. Vallery Stanishev	Stockholm University	Sweden
CoI	Dr. Howard K. Yee	University of Toronto	Canada

Number of investigators: 24

* ESA investigators: 5

Target Summary:

Target	RA	Dec	Magnitude
RCS2319.9+0038	23 19 9.0000	+00 38 0.00	V = 22.0

Target	RA	Dec	Magnitude
--------	----	-----	-----------

Observing Summary:

Target	Config Mode and Spectral Elements	Flags	Orbits
RCS2319.9+0038	ACS/WFC Imaging F850LP		4 (1x4)

Total orbit request: 4

■ Scientific Justification

The signature project of the most ambitious cosmology projects being designed and/or built this decade (LSST/LST/Panstarrs, Dark Energy Camera, JDEM/SNAP/Destiny, South Pole Telescope,...) is the detailed, accurate measurement of the universe’s expansion history, from deceleration through acceleration, to look for clues of the properties and identity of dark energy. Of the small handful of known measurement techniques (SN Ia, cluster counts, S-Z, weak lensing, and baryon oscillations), only Type Ia supernovae (SNe Ia) have actually been developed to the point of routine use; and at the highest redshifts, $z \gtrsim 1$, where the transition from deceleration to acceleration can be studied, only HST observations can provide the required signal-to-noise. Even with the HST the first studies in this decelerating redshift range from both the Higher-Z Team and the Supernova Cosmology Project (Reiss et al 2004, Fadeev, Aldering et al 2004) clearly point to the limiting factor for both statistical and systematic uncertainties: extinction correction.

We propose a new approach to the measurements in this difficult decelerating redshift range: by studying “clean” supernovae discovered specifically in galaxy-cluster ellipticals, we can remove this primary statistical and systematic uncertainty — and do so with a dramatically more efficient use of HST time (see Obs. Strategy section). Moreover, the resulting data set also provides a deep z -band survey of $z \gtrsim 1$ rich clusters, allowing us to take important steps forward with several more of the above-mentioned cosmological measurement techniques. In particular, cluster counting is an extremely sensitive measure of expansion history, but also extremely sensitive to the limiting cluster masses of the survey; we here propose to measure these cluster masses with weak lensing. The South Pole Telescope and the Sunaev-Zeldovich (S-Z) Array are both being built to perform S-Z cosmological-distance measurements, but these have never been calibrated against other distance measurements; the SN Ia measurements of this proposal will provide a sample of distance-calibrated clusters to cross-compare the two techniques. Finally, this proposed data set will open an entire range of clusters studies, addressing cluster formation and [...], with comparisons between optically-selected, IR-selected, and X-ray selected subsamples, and across redshifts. This proposal addresses the questions for the new SN approach first and then those for the other dark energy techniques and cluster studies.

How problematic is the extinction correction uncertainty at $z \gtrsim 1$? The large multiplier between color excess and extinction, e.g., $R_B \sim 4$, inflates the statistical error budget (including uncertainties in intrinsic zero-extinction SN colors) so dramatically that the best HST color measurements at $z > 1$ yield extinction corrections with uncertainties greater than 0.3 [check] mag [cites]. All current results at these redshifts thus depend on the application of a strong prior on SN extinction — a large source of systematic uncertainty because the prior cannot be tested at $z > 1$. In fact this correction is currently the dominant source in both the statistical and systematic uncertainty budget.

How is this problem solved using SNe Ia in ellipticals? In Sullivan et al (2003) we showed that the dispersion about the Hubble diagram for elliptical-hosted SNe is half that of later-type galaxy hosts [give numbers], primarily due to the absence of dust. Thus SNe Ia in ellipticals are statistically each worth *four times* as many SNe in spirals, when making cosmological measurements — and without the aforementioned systematics associated with extinction correction. This extra

weight is even more dramatic at $z > 1$ where color measurements are weaker. Without an extinction prior, the $z > 1$ data in Riess et al. (2004) would give a dispersion of [...], compared with [...] for elliptical hosts, implying a elliptical advantage of [...] to 1.

At lower redshift the lack of significant difference between the central value of the elliptical-host sample's distance modulus at, e.g., $z = 0.5$ and that of the other host-galaxy types gave confidence that evolution of SN environment population is not affecting the shape of the Hubble diagram (because ellipticals would be expected to evolve much more monotonically with redshift than spirals). This would be key test to apply at $z \gtrsim 1$, by comparing the proposed elliptical-hosted sample to the existing GOODS-discovered sample in spirals. This test of population evolution addresses one of the biggest purely systematic uncertainties in a $w-w'$ measurement that depends on these $z > 1$ SNe. Note that for ellipticals the age of [...] goes from [...] to [...] as the redshift varies from [...] to [...].

How is it known that the targeted $z \gtrsim 1$ cluster ellipticals are dust free? There are three clear lines of evidence that the clusters we are targeting are dust free. (1) The Spitzer 3.4 and 4.5 μm measurements show.... [at what level]. (2) The x-ray studies of cluster all show x-ray emission... [at what level, and providing what level of guarantee of dust-free ellipticals]. (3) The dispersion on the cluster color-magnitude diagram is so small [quantify] (see Figure XXX?) that dust can not be contributing more than [quantify?] (unless there is a conspiracy that gives all ellipticals exactly the same amount of dust in their line of sight!).

Why is this cluster search much more efficient at finding (and studying) SNe Ia at $z > \sim 1$ than the previous HST searches in the GOODS fields? In a given ACS image, the number and total luminosity of the potential-host-galaxy ellipticals at $z \gtrsim 1$ is approximately 5 times larger in a field with a rich cluster than in an average GOODS field. This can be seen most clearly in Figure YYY, where we show.... It is therefore significantly more efficient to search in a cluster field (and of course the SNe Ia expected in a typical GOODS field would be found in addition!). Since there were [approximately five times?] more SNe Ia discovered in non-elliptical hosts than in ellipticals in the previous GOODS searches, the cluster search is only expected to yield 5 times more SN Ia in ellipticals at $z \gtrsim 1$, and an increase of approximately 2 times in SNe altogether. [Reword to make this a positive.] In terms of restframe B-band total luminosity (where SN rates have been calibrated), the expected rate is similar... This rate is also consistent with the rate seen in previous searches of clusters below $z = 1$, including one we (SCP) performed with ground-based telescopes (Perlmutter 1995, Pain 1997) and the search of archival HST data by Gal-Yam et al (2002, who rediscovered one of our cluster SNe).

In addition to discovering more SNe Ia per HST orbit, there is another set of major efficiency gains in the *follow-up* of these SNe due to the knowledge that the host is elliptical, the knowledge of the redshift of the cluster, and the higher rate per field. First, the follow-up observations need significantly less signal-to-noise and fewer bands, since the extinction correction no longer dominates the requirements, and the bands can be pre-chosen to match each cluster's known redshift. Second, with the higher discovery rate, we can pre-schedule series of observations for each cluster with a cadence guaranteed to well sample the lightcurves for every supernova discovered. For all but the highest redshift clusters this eliminates the need for expensive TOO follow-up observations!

What is the optimal redshift range, and what limits on w and w' are expected? [Note here

that a requirement is $\gtrsim 20 - 40$ SNe in one redshift bin for weak-lensing amplification averaging, so we treat all the SNe as in one bin...]

Developing other Dark Energy Techniques using this Cluster Data.

- **Description of the Observations**
- **Strategy for Two-Gyro Observations**
- **Special Requirements**
- **Coordinated Observations**
- **Justify Duplications**
- **Previous Related HST Programs**

To be updated

By combining observations from a series of GO programs over a number of HST cycles we have obtained a cumulative sample of high redshift SNe which has yielded new determinations of cosmological parameters ($\Omega_M, \Omega_\Lambda, w$). Equally important, these HST observations have been the basis for studies of possible systematics of the SN technique, such as host-galaxy extinction or evolution. Two such multi-cycle HST studies were published in the past year and both provided confirmation and improved precision on the earlier ground-based accelerating universe results. Knop *et al.*, 2003 (based on GO-7336, GO-7590, GO-8346) presented an analysis of an independent set of 11 high redshift SNe. The high-quality lightcurves available from photometry on WFPC2 make it possible for this sample alone to provide measurements of the cosmological parameters comparable in statistical weight to the previous results. In addition to high-precision lightcurve measurements, this data offered greatly improved color measurements of the high-redshift supernovae, and hence improved host-galaxy extinction estimates. These extinction measurements show no anomalous negative $E(B - V)$ at high redshift. The precision of the measurements is such that it was possible to perform (for the first) time a host-galaxy extinction correction directly for individual supernovae without any assumptions or priors on the parent $E(B - V)$ distribution.

Sullivan *et al.* 2003 (based on GO-8313, GO-9131) presented the Hubble diagram of distant type Ia supernovae (SNe Ia) segregated according to the type of host galaxy. This allowed us to confirm our previous evidence for a cosmological constant by explicitly comparing SNe residing in galaxies likely to contain negligible dust with the larger sample. These data provide a key test of evolutionary systematics.

Other such multi-cycle analyses, described below, are in progress. In particular, this year we are completing final observations of host galaxies after the SNe faded for SNe discovered in GO-9075 and GO-8585.

GO-9727: This cycle 12 program will begin observations in April 2004 using ACS to do a new search for very high redshift ($1.2 > z > 1.6$) SNe Ia in the GOODS-N field. In coordination with Riess (GO-9728), images from 15 ACS pointings will be taken approximately every 45 days

and searched for candidates. Followup photometry will be obtained with ACS and NICMOS for approximately three very high redshift SNe.

GO-9075: In this program, we pushed our SNe Ia studies to the highest redshifts that are feasible for a ground-based discovery and spectroscopic identification campaign. HST follow-up observations for this program started after servicing mission 3B in March 2002 and have been completed for the most part — final reference images are still to be taken. Coordinated with three large search campaigns using the Subaru 8.2 m and also with simultaneous smaller searches using the CTIO 4 m and CFHT 3.6 m, we obtained ACS/WFC and NICMOS/NIC2 photometry for multi-epoch lightcurves of eight Type Ia SNe at high redshift ($0.9 < z < 1.3$). For two of the highest redshift SNe, ACS grism spectra were taken. Analysis of this ACS data is in progress. With the refurbished NICMOS, we obtained final reference images of the host of SN1998eq, which we had previously studied in GO-8088, and these images will allow us to complete that analysis.

GO-8585: In GO 8585 we observed six Type Ia supernovae with HST using WFPC. The supernovae were discovered in ground based searches at the CTIO 4-m, CFHT and Subaru telescopes. We obtained both U- and B-band restframe photometry (using either F814W or F850LP depending on the redshift) for each supernova for a period of 2 months. Analysis of this data is presented in the PhD thesis of J. Raux (Univ. of Paris, 2003), presented at the January 2004 AAS meeting. A publication is in progress.

GO-8313: The objective of this project, which has now been completed with the publication (Sul03) mentioned above, was to obtain snapshot unfiltered STIS images of distant galaxies of known redshift which have hosted supernovae (SNe) of Type Ia found by the SCP, 20 of which are used in the Hubble diagram of 42 type Ia SNe (Perlmutter *et al.* 1999). The internal extinction implied is small, even for late-type systems ($A_B < 0.3$), and the cosmological parameters derived from those SNe Ia hosted by (presumed) dust-free early-type galaxies are consistent with our previous determination of a non-zero Λ . The brightness scatter about the Hubble line for SNe Ia in these early-type hosts is also significantly smaller than for the SNe Ia in late-type galaxies. This result was based on HST STIS “snapshot” images and Keck spectroscopy of SNe spanning the range $0.3 < z < 0.8$.

GO-8346: We had the unique opportunity of following up SN2000fr, which had been discovered *14 days prior* to maximum light in its restframe. Because this supernova at $z=0.54$ was discovered so early we were able to obtain excellent light curves from HST in F555W, F675W and F814W spanning the period from one week prior to maximum light to 6 weeks after. Several spectra of the supernova were taken at VLT and Keck along with NIR photometry at VLT.

DD-8088: WFPC2 and NICMOS (cycle 7) observations were obtained for SN1998eq at $z = 1.20$ (Aldering, *et al.*, 1998,IAUC,7046). The preliminary photometry is consistent with the previous results for Ω_M, Ω_Λ . With the final NICMOS image of the galaxy without the supernova obtained, this analysis can now be completed.

GO-7850 and balance of **GO-7336** and **DD-7590:** WFPC2 and NICMOS observations were obtained for 11 Type Ia supernovae in the redshift range 0.36—0.86. These observations, including final references where necessary, are now complete, and the results were published in Knop, R., *et al.* 2003 as mentioned above. The color information provided by NICMOS (Burns, S., *et al.*, 2001,AAS,199.1610B), was only possible with HST.

GO-7336 and **DD-7590**: Perlmutter *et al.*, 1998, Nature, 391, 51 reported the results of our HST and ground-based imaging and Keck spectroscopic observations of SN1997ap. The HST portion is based on a total of 4 orbits. Also from this program, HST observations of two $z = 0.83$ SNe Ia are included in the analysis in Per99 which reports on the results from our HST and ground-based imaging and Keck spectroscopic observations of 42 type Ia supernovae with $0.18 < z < 0.86$. The paper rules out a flat $\Omega_M = 1$ universe and presents very strong evidence for a positive cosmological constant.